

Two Narratives about Kosovo's Political Friends: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Articles in Two Newspapers

Esin Muzbeg

University of Prishtina, Kosovo
muzbeg@gmail.com

Lindita Tahiri

University of Prishtina, Kosovo
lindita.tahiri@uni-pr.edu
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9679-6589>

Summary. This article analyzes the portrayal of the USA and NATO as Kosovo's friends in the Kosovan media discourse. The research will use the Critical Discourse Analysis based on the model by Van Dijk to demonstrate the production and continuity of the friendship discourse in the Kosovan media. Two daily media outlets are analyzed: *Koha Ditore* and *Epoka e Re*, focusing on the strategies used to construct the image of Kosovo's friends for the countries that have supported the independence of the new state of Kosovo. The ideological framing of the friendship discourse is pointed out as the dominant topic in these two mainstream newspapers, but on the other hand, the papers emphasize two different perspectives of using the discourse of friendship, which are adjusted to the editorial policies and persuasive goals of the respective papers.

Keywords: Kosovan media; USA; NATO; Frame of Friendship; Critical Discourse Analysis; Ideology of the News.

Du naratyvai apie Kosovo politinius draugus: kritinė straipsnių diskurso analizė dviejuose laikraščiuose

Santrauka. Šiame straipsnyje analizuojamas JAV ir NATO, kaip Kosovo draugų, vaizdavimas Kosovo žiniasklaidos diskurse. Tyrimė bus naudojama kritinio diskurso analizė, pagrįsta Van Dijk'o modeliu, siekiant parodyti draugystės diskurso susiformavimą ir tęstinumą Kosovo žiniasklaidoje. Analizuojamos dvi kasdienės žiniasklaidos priemonės: *Koha Ditore* ir *Epoka e Re*, daugiausia dėmesio skiriant strategijoms, naudojamoms kuriant Kosovo draugų įvaizdį šalims, kurios rėmė naujos Kosovo valstybės nepriklausomybę. Ideologinis draugystės diskurso kūrimas nurodomas kaip dominuojanti tema šiuose dviejuose pagrindiniuose laikraščiuose, kita vertus, laikraščiuose pabrėžiamos dvi skirtingos draugystės diskurso panaudojimo perspektyvos, kurios yra pritaikytos prie atitinkamų straipsnių redakcinės politikos ir įtikinamų tikslų.

Pagrindiniai žodžiai: Kosovo žiniasklaida; JAV; NATO; draugystės rėmas; kritinio diskurso analizė; naujų ideologija.

Received: 2021-01-20. **Accepted:** 2022-01-28

Copyright © 2022 Esin Muzbeg, Lindita Tahiri. Published by Vilnius University Press. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution Licence](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Introduction

After the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) intervention in 1999, on the 12th of June Kosovo gained its freedom, which culminated with the declaration of independence on February 17, 2008. Since 1989 when the Serbian leader Slobodan Milošević brought Kosovo directly under the Serbian government, ethnic Albanians in Kosovo struggled to gain peace with nonviolent means and passive resistance until the end of 1997, when the Kosovo Liberation Army (KLA) arrived on the scene. The conflict between the KLA and the Serbian army was resolved with the intervention of NATO, after futile efforts to diplomatically solve the situation. This process was supported by most of the European states and in particular by the USA. Hence, the theme of Kosovo's friends has been constantly produced and reproduced in the media discourse of the country, focusing on the friendship with the USA, which has almost acquired the power of an axiom. The discourse of friendship with our allies has been ideologically reproduced not only in editorials but also in the news, which is traditionally based on the principles of neutrality and objectivity. The term 'ideology' does not imply the reduced meaning of indoctrination and it is used following Van Dijk's notion of mental representations and cognitive structures: for him ideology is similar to grammar underlying language, reflecting the basic criteria that constitute social identity (van Dijk, 1998).

Ideology functions by encircling you within a worldview that has its own background and reference which produce the interpretation of everything happening around you. "If you are ideologically committed you will be inclined to imply that your interpretation of a text is the only one which is valid, that it is somehow in the text indeed, needing only to be discovered, uncovered, revealed by expert exegesis" (Bell, 2011, p. 523). The discourse of Kosovo's friends is used to refer to states, organizations, institutions, and individuals who have supported Kosovo's independence and have contributed to the development of the country. This discourse is produced in the language of media and politicians, and it is constructed within the frame of friendship based on the support of the international community that Kosovo received to gain its liberty and independence.

News is expected to be factual and impartial, in accordance with the basic principles of journalism. As Potter states (2013, p. 157), there is a widespread belief in the public that news is objective and that it reflects the most important happenings each day, without realizing that news is a construction. What media present is not the events themselves, but stories about the events told from a specific news perspective. The media construction is difficult to depict when the stories told by the news are influenced by ideological framing. Hence, the main research question of this paper is: "How is the friendship discourse constructed in two mainstream Kosovan newspapers, and which is the dominant ideological framing of the two media outlets?"

The discourse of friendship is not exempted from ideology and each media represent a specific and ideologically influenced point of view. The objective of this paper is to examine the same contents in two different Kosovan mainstream newspapers, comparing their different conceptual perspectives. The main focus of this research is the ideological position of the text of the news, which is assumed to be neutral and objective due to the lack of explicit comments. By revealing the implicit ideology of the news, this study

aims to contribute to a better understanding of how ideologies are reproduced and transferred during the routine everyday reporting of the news. The specific code of ideology transferring will be analyzed, with the hypothesis that the more an ideology is built upon accustomed and accepted principles by the audience, the easier will be its reception. As van Dijk claims, “ideologies are not innate but learned... That is, ideologies are typically produced and reproduced by talk or text by ideological discourse, such as party programs, parliamentary debates, news reports and editorials, textbooks,” etc. (van Dijk, 2015, p. 4). The critical approach of the media discourse is understandably considered as an efficient tool of demonstrating implicit ideological standpoints and their reproduction technique. Consequently, the Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) in this paper aspires to make an impact on the unveiling of the persuasion strategies of media ideology.

There have not been sufficient studies regarding the journalistic discourse in Kosovo, and Kosovan scholars have applied CDA in literature analysis, mostly in regard to the doctrine of Socialist Realism applied in the former communist countries (Apolloni, 2016; Tahiri, 2013). There are a few studies on the media discourse, such as the analysis of the structure of the journalistic text by Kosumi (2013), or the research of Mavraj and Tahiri (2019) who focus on the dominant narratives in Kosovo media about Russia by comparing three media outlets, pointing out the foregrounded and the suppressed readings which create the ground for broader intended strategic objectives of media discourse. Tahiri (2013, pp. 61-71) has applied CDA on the Kosovo coverage of the 2008-2011 period by three newspapers: The Washington Post, The New York Times, and The Guardian, analyzing the framing of Dick Marty’s report in connection with the role allocation of the main social actors in news articles, following the functional model developed by M. A. K. Halliday. Despite the thematic differences of the studies, they all demonstrate the political and ideological transfer performed in the media discourse.

For the purpose of this study, two Kosovan major media have been selected: *Koha Ditore* daily newspaper and *Epoka e Re* newspaper. Influence, circulation, and reputation were criteria of choice of the sample media outlets: *Koha Ditore* is a privately-owned printed daily newspaper which has been established by international donors and has the reputation of independence from the daily politics, aiming to target active and critical readers. According to IREX (2018, p. 1), this daily paper is one of the main newspapers in Kosovo and according to Index Kosova (quoted in OSCE, 2010, p. 13), it has a readership of over 30% of the population. On the other hand, *Epoka e Re* has less readership (OSCE, 2010, p. 15) and its editorial policies stand close to the state power and leadership (Kosumi, 2013, p. 39), inclining towards political leaders who were former senior figures in KLA.

Theoretical background

News pretends to be objective and neutral media production; however, this does not rule out the transfer of ideological codes. Critical approaches to media first and foremost point out the relationship between media and ideology (Dursun, 2001, p. 19). The critical analysis of news makes it possible to deconstruct this relationship, as Van Dijk points out

that “News structure analysis shows us where and how ideologies preferably manifest themselves in news reports.” (2008, p. 195).

The ideological transfer of the media news, which is the focus of study in this paper, is considered neither as a positive nor a negative concept: the habitual everyday reproduction of this ideology is pointed out within the framework of news in the media. Nevertheless, the ideological transfer implies a transfer of specific values and worldviews which the ideology is composed of and which produce a relationship of power. Noam Chomsky and Edvard S. Herman (2012) explain how media manufactures the power relationship by propaganda means. Manufacturing power is not independent of ideology, and the media discourse that is examined in this paper represents an example of the construction of the power hierarchy by framing the concept of the Kosovo international allies and the country's gratefulness towards them.

The neutrality, as well as the inevitability of the notion of ideology, is pointed out by van Dijk (2019), who regards it as part of cognitive structures. Ideologies include the ideas of a group and therefore may be considered as group attitudes, absorbed in a step-by-step process by the society that belongs to this specific ideology due to the specific language and discourse (van Dijk, 2019, pp. 37-47). This very general notion of ideology is also emphasized by Fairclough, who considers that language is a material form of ideology that is surrounded by ideology superimposed over discourse (2015, p. 124).

Furthermore, Althusser sees media as one of the ideological apparatuses of the state which serves as a tool for maintaining social control and for presenting what is ideologically correct (2000, p. 35). Yet, the institutional connotation of the word “tool” expressed by Althusser should not be taken fully into account, as media does not necessarily have to belong to the state to function as an ideological instrument. As Therborn states (1989, p. 75-76), the ideological devices are constituent components of the organization of power within a society, therefore media discourse is very successful in constructing and developing a long-lasting ideological effect. “Media discourse is a very powerful tool of controlling society, which individuals cannot resist as easily as they resist direct personal manipulation” (Tahiri, 2013, p. 174). In addition to the transfer of ideological codes, media also strengthens the particular social order and serves to the functional ideology. (Eagleton, 2015, pp. 197–198).

As Özer says, there is a general ideological atmosphere and media is part of it (2011, p. 61-62). This implies that the news discourse is the product of multiple hands, and the processes by which it is molded and modified are both crucial and enlightening for an understanding of the eventual news text, its form, and its content (Bell, 1995, p. 26). There is an interaction between media production and ideology sustainment, and as van Dijk claims, discourse consists of a few layers and processes according to which the publisher or the author are not the prime movers of the discourse creation (2019, p. 331). By repeating a specific discourse in the media, it becomes more permanent and enduring in society, and if this discourse is institutionalized, then it becomes even more efficient.

Accordingly, it is crucial to identify and interpret the role of media discourse in the construction and transformation of the social representation of reality, and CDA is a useful descriptive and interpretative framework for viewing language as a strategic meaning-making resource. This kind of approach has a dual advantage, since understanding the

functioning of ideology in media puts forward critical awareness about the media discourse. The critical approach towards media discourse since the Frankfurt school has exposed the relation between media and ideology; however, for a detailed micro-level explanation, the analysis of the text of the news is necessary. The explicit ideological standpoint or the reproduction of the dominant ideology by media sometimes may grow into propaganda, and these instances are not difficult to tell. Alternatively, the implicit ideological reproductions and in particular habitual ideology transfers are very difficult to detect. Therefore, the CDA approach enables the uncovering of the dominant ideological indicators at the microlevel of the media discourse and provides evidence for the fundamental role of media in exercising political power.

Methodology

The sampling period of this study is focused on the 12th of June, which is the anniversary of the NATO troops' entry in Kosovo in 1999 after the successful military intervention in Yugoslavia, which had started on March the 24th of that year. The reason for choosing the period around the twentieth anniversary of the day when the NATO troops entered Kosovo and the country was liberated is because of the typical media coverage and messages to the public about the support of Kosovo's friends that are expected on this occasion. The USA's former president Bill Clinton and the former secretary of state Madelaine Albright participated in the ceremony, as well as the leadership of European states. The samples for the analysis consist of news on the day of the ceremony as well as on the day before and after it.

The discourse about the international friends of Kosovo has a continuing usage in the social life of Kosovo. This demonstrates the effect of the reproduction of the dominant discourse in the news and the relation between the media discourse and the institutionalization of a specific ideology within the society that the media is part of. The friendship discourse has become one of the main pillars of the foreign policy in Kosovo; therefore, this paper has chosen a specific period of representation of this discourse which has become prevalent after the NATO intervention in Kosovo. The two mainstream newspapers that are chosen are dissimilar both in their origin and their ideological positioning: *Koha Ditore* started its publication with international support, whereas *Epoka e Re* enjoys potent national support.

This paper is intended as part of a more extensive and broad study. It aims to depict the linguistic indicators of the friendship discourse and the interaction with other ideological discourses. The twentieth anniversary of the liberation of Kosovo is a suitable opportunity to keep track of the evolution of the discourse about the international friends of the country. Priority is given to headlines, subheadings, and the news, which reveal the subjectivity in the macrostructure. The respective corpus for analysis is chosen to focus on the representation of main news, of the background as well as the context, neglecting the information transfers that are irrelevant for the aim of the study.

As CDA has become a diverse and interdisciplinary field of research during the last decades, this paper will refer to the model developed by van Dijk (1988) in *News as Discourse*, focusing on the ideological context of the background and the macro and microstructure of the news, to point out the dominant discourse articulated in the news.

To understand the effect of ideology, CDA focuses on the deep analysis of the text examining the macro and microstructures. The macrostructures of the news are examined from both thematic and structural aspects. Perhaps even more than for other discourse types, the thematic organization of news discourse plays a crucial role. Therefore, this systematic analysis of the textual structures of news begins with an explication of notions like theme or topic. Intuitively, a topic or theme is what the discourse is about, globally speaking, and it belongs to the global, macro-level of discourse description (van Dijk, 1988, pp. 30-31). News headlines are the overall structure that articulates the summary, the core meaning, and the attitude about the topic of the news. The thematic structure of news includes headlines, followed by other structures such as the overline, the subheading, the introduction, and the background, which are the main elements of the macrostructure.

Longer discourses usually contain several topics, some of which are more general or abstract than others, so the whole macrostructure has a hierarchical organization, in which each sequence of macro propositions can be subsumed under a higher-level macro proposition. These hierarchical relationships can be defined by macro rules, which represent what we intuitively understand by summarizing the information of a text to its topics, which according to van Dijk is performed by three major macro rules: deletion, generalization, and construction (1988, p. 32).

When the text of the news includes the expression 'Kosovo's friends' there is a general interpretation of the audience about who these friends are and what is their contribution to the country, which influences the expectancies of the audience. The interpretation of a text by language users does not take place when the language user has interpreted all the words and sentences of the whole text. Rather, the reader starts to make guesses about the most probable topic of a text, aided by the thematic signals of the writer (van Dijk, 1988, p. 34).

On the other hand, the discourse microstructure is manifested locally and is indicated in the lexical level, as sometimes ideological implications may be inferred from a single word. According to van Dijk (1988, pp. 62-64), only the top of the information is visible, and most other information is personally or socially shared and cognitively represented by the language users, depending on the assumptions and beliefs of the speaker/writer. This provides us with a subtle instrument for the ideological analysis of the news discourse. Moreover, their analysis also requires substantial amounts of political and social background knowledge. Significant use of indirectness not only expresses ideological positions but also requires from the analyst the ability to make such ideologies explicit (Van Dijk, 1988, p. 71).

The macro and microanalysis of the discourse of Kosovo's friends aim to reveal the ideological context of the news through the thematic and structural analysis as well as through the lexical and rhetoric analysis. The thematic macro analysis will take into consideration the introduction and the illustrations, whereas the structural analysis will concentrate on the representation of events, on the context and basic information as well as on the evaluation and comments. The microanalysis will focus on the syntactical transformations, cohesion, the discourse style, the lexical choice, and their contextual relations.

Findings and discussion

Macrostructure: headlines, illustrations, introductions, background, and comments

The table below compares some headlines and overlines of the anniversary, the day before and the day after in both media outlets:

Headlines	Differences	Similarities
Koha Ditore		
1 Clinton: The World Has to See Kosovo Committed and Progressive	Clinton's declarations and his critical attitude about Kosovo and the need to make more progress are in the spotlight. The criticism of the situation in Kosovo comes from heroic figures such as Bill Clinton, and therefore the implication about the problematic situation in the country is very serious and grave.	The headlines use summarizing and generalization of the information and foreground USA leaders, excluding other European and Regional leaders in main news. Although the 20 th -anniversary liberation is the main topic of the articles, the figure of Bill Clinton is foregrounded as more important than the ceremony itself.
2 20th Anniversary of Liberation brings back in Kosovo the Protagonists of History		
3 Clinton: Make Kosovo		
4 Kosovo Honors the 20th Anniversary of NATO Troops Entry		
Epoka e re		
1 Clinton and Albright Come to Celebrate the 20th Anniversary of Kosovo Liberation	There are causative relations within the headline: Clinton is coming to Kosovo as a hero and Kosovo is thankful to its friends.	ore. The former US leaders' contribution is highlighted in both outlets, despite their diverse ideological stance.
2 The Republic of Kosovo Celebrates Tomorrow the 20th Anniversary of the NATO Troops' Entry	There is harmony between the headlines "Kosovo Liberation" and "NATO troops' Entry" to produce the discourse of Kosovo's friends.	
3 The Hero of the Kosovo Freedom		
4 Kosovo is Thankful to the Friends of Liberty		

Although the news headlines in Kosovan media typically contain one sentence and therefore have a lot of information, the headlines used during the 3 days around the anniversary celebration include reduced and generalized information. By the thematic model of van Dijk about the transfer of the information within the macrostructure, there are no explanations about who is the hero and who are the friends, neither time and nor place of the ceremony are specified, however, this information is provided with the photos and other elements. The comparison of the illustrations used in both outlets further reinforces the similarities and differences which are depicted in the headlines.

The newspaper *Koha Ditore* has used a total of 7 photos, two of which are on the front page, showing President Clinton and President Thaçi (12.06.2019) in the military ceremony, and the other one has also Secretary Albright with them (13.06.2019) in the same ceremony. Inside the paper, there is a photograph of Albright meeting former President Jahjaga, as well as photographs from the NATO ceremony (12.06.2019). The analysis of the photos demonstrates the importance given to the American authorities in relation to

the Kosovan authorities, which have a second-hand role. For instance, the face of Jahjaga is hardly visible when she hugs Secretary Albright.

As for *Epoka e Re*, on the day of the ceremony, there is large photograph of Bill Clinton and two smaller photos of Albright-Jahjaga and Clinton-Thaçi. The figure of President Clinton as the hero is foregrounded, and he is depicted greeting the audience. One of the smaller photos shows Albright with the former Kosovo President Jahjaga, whose face is hardly visible, and the other photography shows an image from the meeting of President Clinton and President Thaci, who is also given a prominent role as one of the significant participants of the historical events. Otherwise from *Koha Ditore*, it is obvious that right after the visual prominence of President Clinton, the next highlighted figure is Kosovo's President Thaçi.

The table below presents further resemblances and divergences regarding other elements of the macrostructure of both newspapers.

	Subheadings, photography spots, background, and context	Differences	Similarities
	Koha Ditore		
1	With the presence of its living heroes, Kosovo celebrated the 20 th anniversary of its liberation from Serbia. President Bill Clinton said that Kosovo makes him very proud, but he refused to give his advice as he said that Kosovans should make Kosovo now. His right hand, the former secretary Madeleine Albright, recalled her promise to help people come back after the Milošević regime vacated the country. General Wesley Clark, who was the NATO head 20 years ago, expressed his wish to see Kosovo as part of the biggest global military alliance. (13.06.2019)	The disapproving tone of Clinton towards Kosovo is foregrounded, pointing out his withdrawal from personal recommendations as Kosovans should themselves contribute to the prosperity of their country, with the implication that Kosovo has not made sufficient progress. There is an extremely critical tone and a strong contextual background, where the freedom of Kosovo from Serbia is compared to the freedom from the Kosovan leadership.	Besides the historical background and the quotations of the international leaders, the news also includes evaluative observations regarding the represented The ideological transfer of the event is supported by historical references, such as the words of President Clinton and Secretary Albright.
2	Kosovo celebrated with the live heroes the 20 th anniversary of the liberation from Serbia. These heroes have sent messages for the leadership that the Kosovans want to get free from. (13.06.2019).		Besides the US former leaders added other international figures who have a secondary role compared to US representatives.
3	Our armed forces today joined the NATO allies for the air raids against the Serbian forces who are responsible for the brutality in Kosovo.' These are the words that were told to the American people by the main protagonist who initiated the intervention of NATO on the night of 24 March 1999. (12.06.2019)	The introduction is usually presented in direct relation with the past events by mentioning the suppression of the Milloshević regime and the reasons for the NATO intervention, where the role of the USA is highlighted.	The discourse of friendship is permeated all through the text, and it is highlighted with specific contextual and historical events.
4	I remember walking on the dusty road, with twenty thousand displaced people, young and old together, where a boy was holding a placard: 'I love America. (13.06.2019)		

5	I was the President of United States when you needed help when you were threatened to abandon your homes” said Clinton after the meeting with president Thaçi (12.06.2019)		
Epoka e re			
1	The great Kosovo friend, the former president of the USA, Bill Clinton, has arrived in Kosovo on Tuesday for the ceremony of the 20 th anniversary of the Kosovo liberation. He was paid great respect by the highest institutional representatives of Kosovo. President Hashim Thaçi honored the guest with the “Medal of Peace“, and President Clinton said that he was proud to have been the USA president when the decision for the military intervention in Kosovo was taken. According to him, Kosovo deserves to be part of NATO, the EU, and every other international organization. (12.06.2019)	The discourse of friendship is strengthened with approval tones of President Clinton who declares that Kosovo deserves to be a member of NATO and EU as well as in other organizations. The discourse of friendship is intensified with the welcome extended to the heroes by the Kosovo people and with the inauguration of the statue for the honor of the former secretary of state Albright.	
2	The former American president Bill Clinton and former secretary of state Madeleine Albright have arrived as heroes in Prishtina. Thousands of citizens were out in the streets for the celebration of the 20 th anniversary of Kosovo liberation to express their gratitude to the high American officials who two decades ago had decided for the NATO attack of former Yugoslavia. Clinton and Albright said they were proud that their decision had stopped the ethnic cleansing of Albanians from the Serbian army. For this occasion, the statue of former secretary of state Albright was inaugurated. (13.06.2019)	Gradual representation of events starting with the arrival of the US leaders, continuing with the portrayal of their heroism and contribution for the freedom of Kosovo, and culminating in the thankfulness of the Kosovo people, represented by the words of the Kosovo President.	
3	We express our reverence and deep gratitude to you for the freedom of our country. We express deep gratitude to the USA for leading the campaign to stop the ethnic cleansing and made it possible for the Kosovo citizens to come back home and to build a new life with peace for everyone“. (12.06.2019).	The connection is built between the military intervention of NATO and the democratic state of Kosovo, mentioning the pride about the new state, contextualizing the ceremony of the 20 th anniversary of the Kosovo liberation	
4	I will always be proud that I was the USA president when you needed someone to speak up and say that there will not be ethnic cleansing. (12.06.2019)		

As the examples show, there are sub-categories and layers such as the background and the context that support the dominant discourse and that are more than news topics or events. The discourse of Kosovo's friends and allies is built up gradually according to the importance assigned to events, starting with the US representatives as well as with the Kosovo leaders with a gradation of referring to Kosovo's friends: on the first day their arrival is announced, on the second day they are presented as heroes of the Kosovo liberation, and on the third day when Kosovo expresses its thankfulness to them.

The role of the USA for the NATO intervention is highlighted, mentioning the ethnic cleansing as a reason but not giving details about it. The discourse of the friends of Kosovo is intensified by labeling the US leaders as heroes and by quoting their declarations which are maximally used in *Epoka e Re* to draw attention to the historical context. The summary of the two decades of history in Kosovo and the perspective for the future serves as the background revealing the relations of the past with the present. It is noticeable that in the cases without a historical background the causal relations between the events are not sufficiently clear.

By the model of van Dijk, the scheme of the friendship discourse is additionally presented cyclically, as in the paragraph of *Epoka e Re*, where the USA is presented as a friend of Kosovo not only under the leadership of the democratic party but also afterward in the period when the conservative party was in power. The continuity and the repetition of the friendship strengthen the dominant discourse, which is intensified with the declaration of Clinton about what Kosovo deserves. The cyclical repetition of the friendship produces the same discourse which continues with other categories of the news, such as declarations of Kosovo's Prime Minister and President, who are emphasized in *Epoka e Re*.

The quotations selected for the texts in both outlets as well as the historical references and the background reveal the attitude and position of the respective media. These attitudes and positions are processed automatically by the readership in the daily routine of media consumption, without being aware of the ideological transfer during the news reporting. Consequently, the ceremony of the 20th anniversary of the Kosovo liberation is reported in both newspapers to intensify the discourse of the friends of Kosovo, however with ideological differences as *Epoka e Re* attributes the friendship and heroism to the Kosovo political leadership whereas *Koha Ditore* employs the same framework of friendship to criticize the local leadership.

Microstructure: syntactical transformations, cohesion, discourse style, rhetoric

Koha Ditore

Subjects of events are Kosovan and American leaders who are portrayed as heroes such as in: "Kosovo celebrated with the live heroes" (13.06.2019), which implicitly suggests that the effort for liberation is always alive. The first-person pronoun in Clinton's quotation: "I was the USA President when you needed help" (13.06.2019) determines his active role and his importance in contrast to the weakness of the Kosovan people in need. In the fragments below, President Clinton is the subject of verbs denoting positive action and decisiveness whereas Serbia and Milošević are subjects of verbs with adverse semantic references:

“President Bill Clinton demonstrated the determination of the NATO reaction against Serbian aggression and the brutish attacks of Milošević in Kosovo.” (Koha Ditore, 12.06.2019).

“He was the USA president in 1999 when he decided to respond with strength to the -Serbian massacres over Albanians.” (Koha Ditore, 13.06.2019).

The coherence within the theoretical framing of the news is achieved with causal, functional, and referential relations. The sentences which describe the NATO intervention, the initiative of the USA’s President, the reasons for the intervention preventing the Serbian massacre, all these propositions are congruent with one another.

“Protagonists of historical events are back in Kosovo for the anniversary of the liberation day. President Clinton was decorated with the Medal of Peace for his contribution for the freedom of Kosovo” (12.06.2019). The two sentences have a causal relation, as Clinton is decorated because he is a protagonist. Whereas the headline: “The World Has to See Kosovo Committed and Progressive” (12.06.2019) builds functional relations between ‘Kosovo’ and ‘progress’, with the implication that ‘progress’ refers to ‘democracy’.

The discourse style focuses on the specific quotations of the USA leaders, which serve as criticism for the Kosovo leadership, as in the above-quoted headline, which implies that there is not sufficient progress made in the country. The discourse of Kosovo’s friends is supported and intensified, such as in: “With the presence of its living heroes” (13.06.2019); “his right hand, the former US secretary”; “the protagonists of historical events are back in Kosovo” (12.06.2019).

The rhetoric of the news is supported with quotations of the leaders, with photos, statistical data, memories, and so on. These rhetorical means increase the trustfulness by giving evidence such as Clinton’s declaration of 20 years ago, Albright’s account of the refugees in Macedonia, where she had seen a boy holding the placard ‘I love America’. Furthermore, the statistical data about the American superiority during the NATO intervention is repeated twice: “USA covered 60 percent of the air raids and over 80 percent of the total number of attacks” (Koha Ditore, 12.06.2019, 13.06.2019).

Epoka e Re

When Clinton and Kosovo’s leaders (Thaçi, and Haradinaj) are subjects of sentences, their articulation is in active mode, foregrounding their decisiveness and their important role. The lexical attributions to Clinton are all in superlative, such as: “The great friend of Kosovo”, “greeted with the highest state honors”, “the hero of the Kosovo liberation” (12.06.2019). An important role is assigned to president Thaçi who “awarded the Kosovo friend with the Medal of Peace”. Clinton uses first person singular in his speech when saying that he is proud to be the leader of the NATO attacks against ethnic cleansing. On the other hand, president Thaçi uses the inclusive plural form, saying that “we express our reverence and deep gratitude to you for the freedom of our country”, which points out the hierarchical relation between the two leaders and their respective countries.

There is a strong cohesion in the news regarding the ceremony, which is created through causative, functional and referential relations. The causative relation is built between NATO’s intervention and the ending of the Serbian genocide. Furthermore, there

is a causative relation between NATO's intervention and the building of democracy in the new state. There is a functional relation between the support of the USA and the building of democracy in the new state. The referential relation is obvious in the sentence: "This historical event enables our children to live in freedom. They are free to live their life, to have their own dreams, and to have their own state of Kosovo" (Epoka e Re, 12.06.2019).

The lexical choice is compatible with the discourse of friendship, due to the attributes given to Kosovo's friends and their actions, as well as the attributes of the new democratic state of Kosovo, which was the goal of the USA. There is a particular emotional emphasis in the rhetoric of thankfulness to Kosovo's friends for achieving freedom. This discourse style contributes to the rhetoric of persuasion, which is intensified with the author's selection of the declarations, of the sources, of the historical background, as well as the photos that are chosen for illustration which highlight President Clinton and President Hashim Thaçi. The US and Kosovan leaders are depicted either greeting warmly each other or hugging, which refers to their sincere friendship.

Conclusion

The two outlets *Epoka e Re* and *Koha Ditore* produce and strengthen the discourse of Kosovo's friendship with the USA and NATO, however with ideological differences which reflect their editorial policy. As Bell (1995, p. 26) claims, the idea of the story is central to news, and journalists do not write articles; they write stories—with structure, order, viewpoint, and values. The stories of these two daily newspapers create different viewpoints and values, although they both construct the same discourse of Kosovo's friendship with the USA and NATO.

Epoka e Re has one day more of coverage before the ceremony of the anniversary celebration, on the day of arrival of the international guests in Kosovo. The main topics of the news in *Epoka e Re* revolve around the activities of the 20th anniversary of the Kosovo liberation, starting with the arrival of the US leaders, continuing with the portrayal of their heroism and contribution to the freedom of Kosovo, and culminating in the thankfulness of the Kosovan people.

Koha Ditore similarly confirms the discourse of friendship with the USA and NATO allies, foregrounding the role of the international leaders. Although the 20th-anniversary liberation is the main topic of the articles, the figure of Bill Clinton however is highlighted as more important than the ceremony itself. Contrarily to *Epoka e Re*, there is a prevailing critical tone towards the Kosovo leadership, which is following the editorial policy of this newspaper. The main focus is given to the American authorities, concerning the Kosovan authorities which have a second-hand role. The rhetoric of the news is supported with quotations of the leaders, with photos, statistical data, and accounts of events that create a causative relationship with the discourse of Kosovo's friends, confirming and rationalizing the NATO intervention in the country.

Where *Epoka e Re* emphasizes the connections between the military intervention of NATO and the Serbian aggression, *Koha Ditore*, on the other hand, mentions the Milošević regime but does not generalize the Serbian nation. *Epoka e Re* produces a justification

for the intervention referring to the democratic state of Kosovo as “Clinton’s pride about the new state”, whereas *Koha Ditore* implies criticism of the Kosovo institutions in the declarations of Clinton. The attributes of the new democratic state of Kosovo in *Epoka e Re* are referred to as the goal of the USA, and the US and Kosovo’s leaders are depicted either greeting warmly each other or hugging, which strengthens the sincerity of the discourse about friendship.

The analysis of the samples from the two outlets demonstrates the production, reproduction, and strengthening of the dominant ideological discourse in these newspapers which is in tune with their goal of persuasion, supported by the respective selection of the sources, quotations, historical background, photos, as well as with the linguistic choices. Although these two newspapers belong to different ideological positions, *Epoka e Re* being close to the state apparatus whereas *Koha Ditore* displaying a strong note of opposition, both of them contribute to the construction and preservation of the dominant discourse of Kosovo political friends, using this discourse for their ideological purposes.

The dominant narratives on Kosovo’s political friends demonstrate the persuasive effect of the media discourse in society, which in Kosovo’s case has become institutionalized rhetoric in foreign policy. The CDA of the two alternative narratives of the friendship framework displays the media strategies used to transfer ideological codes, revealing the cognitive power that ideology has in orienting our comprehension of the world and reality.

Obviously, this study has certain limitations which go beyond the scope of the paper. The friendship discourse is addressed only within one event of the anniversary of Kosovo’s liberation, and a complete survey of this topic would require research of the beginnings and the development of this discourse. However, the analysis of the friendship discourse in a single significant event reveals the construction and reproduction of the respective ideology, which otherwise would not be easy to discern. Furthermore, the ideological discourse produced in the media continues to develop regardless of its identification, and it may transform into other discourses. For instance, the discourse in *Koha Ditore* considers the Milošević regime accountable for the genocide against the Albanians in Kosovo, and on the other hand, *Epoka e Re* points towards the Serbian people. This is an important indicator of the ideology of nationalism which can be additionally explored in other studies. Hence, the contribution of this study may be an incentive for further research, which would examine not only the continuity of the transferred ideology of friendship but also its interaction with other discourses.

Sources

Newspapers *Koha Ditore*, published on 12.06.2019 and 13.06.2019.

Newspapers *Epoka e Re*, published on 11.06.2019, 12.06.2019, and 13.06.2019.

References

- Althusser, L. (2000). *İdeoloji ve Devletin İdeolojik Aygıtları* (4th ed.). İletişim yayınları.
 Apolloni, A. (2016). *Parabola Postmoderne* (1st ed.). SHB. “OM”.

- Bell, A. (1995). Language and the Media. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 15, 23–41. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0267190500002592>
- Bell, A. (2011). Re-constructing Babel: Discourse analysis, hermeneutics, and the Interpretive Arc. *Discourse Studies*, 13(5), 519–568. <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1461445611412699>
- Dursun, Ç. (2001). *TV Haberlerinde İdeoloji* (1st ed.). İmge Kitabevi.
- Eagleton, T. (2015). *İdeoloji* (4th ed.). Ayrıntı yayınları.
- Fairclough, N. (2015). Dil ve İdeoloji. In B. Çoban & Z. Özarslan (Eds.), *Söylem ve İdeoloji* (pp. 121–136). Su Yayınevi.
- Herman, E. S., & Chomsky, N. (2012). *Rızanın imalatı: Kitle Medyasının Ekonomi Politikği* (2nd ed.). Bgst yayınları.
- Kosumi, B. (2013). *Tipoloji dhe zhaner*. Olymp.
- Mavraj, M., & Tahiri, L. (2019). The image of Russia in the Kosovo media discourse: comparison between the public and the private media. *Informacijas mokslai*, 86, 23–40. <https://doi.org/10.15388/Im.2019.86.24>
- Özer, Ö. (2011). *Haber Söylem İdeoloji – eleştirel haber çözümlenmeleri*. Literatürk.
- Potter, J. W. (2013). *Media Literacy* (6th edition). Sage.
- Tahiri, L. A. (2013). *Gjuha dhe lufta e ideve*. Naimi.
- Therborn, G. (1989). *İktidarın İdeolojisi ve İdeolojinin İktidarı* (1st ed.). İletişim yayınları.
- van Dijk, T. A. (1988). *News as Discourse*. Lawrence Erlbaum.
- van Dijk, T. A. (1993). Principles of critical discourse analysis. *Discourse & Society*, 4(2), 249–283. <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0957926593004002006>
- van Dijk, T. A. (1998). Opinions and Ideologies in the Press. In A. Bell & P. Garrett (Eds.), *Approaches to Media Discourse* (pp. 21–62). Blackwell Publishers.
- van Dijk, T. A. (2008). News, Discourse, and Ideology. In T. Hanitzsch & K. Wahl-Jorgensen (Eds.), *The Handbook of Journalism Studies* (pp. 191–204). Routledge.
- van Dijk, T. A. (2015). Ideology. In G. Mazzoleni (Ed.), *International Encyclopedia of Political Communication*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118541555.wbiepc011>
- van Dijk, T. A. (2019). *İdeoloji, Multidisipliner Bir Yaklaşım* (1st ed.). Hece Yayınları.

Reports

- Mehmeti, J. (2019). *Media Sustainability Index, Pristina: International Research & Exchanges Board*. <https://www.irex.org/sites/default/files/pdf/media-sustainability-index-europe-eurasia-2019-kosovo.pdf>
- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe. (2010). *Tirazhi dhe politizimi i mediave të shkruara në Kosovë, Pristina: OSCE Departamenti i Demokratizimit*. <https://www.osce.org/sq/kosovo/67791>